SM

French Sarah

Attachments:

From: Hampel Philip Sent: 15 April 2019 13:03

Cc: Beardsworth Robert, Development Control, Kerry BABINGTON

(Kerry Babington@HistoricEngland.org.uk); Goodyear James

Subject: Land To The North Of Castle Street And South-East Of Waterhouse Lane, Including

Castle Buildings And The Earl De Grey Public House - 19/00333/FULL & 19/00334/LBC A63+Castle+Street_Scheme+Map-01.jpg; 6459 May 1944.jpg; 6459A May 1944.jpg;

6459B July 1952.jpg; 6459E exist April 1996.jpg; 6459E Prop March 1999.jpg; 6459M Feb

2003.jpg; EdeG-001.jpg

Town and Country Planning Act 1990

Application Number: 19/00333/FULL

Proposal: Application for full planning permission for the

demolition and partial rebuilding of the Earl de Grey public house; erection of link extension to Castle Buildings and the Earl de Grey; external alterations to Castle Buildings; use of relocated Earl de Grey, Castle Buildings and link extension for café or restaurant (A3) and/or drinking establishment (A4) and/or office (B1a); the erection of a nine-storey hotel; new public realm and associated works, including landscaping, car parking and servicing,

and associated infrastructure.

At: Land To The North Of Castle Street And South-East

Of Waterhouse Lane, Including Castle Buildings And

The Earl De Grey Public House

Kingston Upon Hull

HU1 2DA

Town and Country Planning Act 1990

Application Number: 19/00334/LBC

Proposal: Application for listed building consent for

demolition and partial rebuilding of Earl de Grey Public House; erection of link extension to Castle

Buildings and Earl de Grey; refurbishment,

reconfiguration of, and external alterations to Castle

Buildings.

At: Land To The North Of Castle Street And South-East

Of Waterhouse Lane, Including Castle Buildings And

The Earl De Grey Public House

Kingston Upon Hull

HU1 2DA

Dear Simon,

Site comments – This application relates to an irregular shaped site, situated on the corner of Castle Street (A63) and Waterhouse Lane, south of the Bonus Arena and west of the Princes Quay multi-storey car park. The site is not within a conservation area, but it is within the setting of the Old Town conservation area and several listed buildings. The site, largely a car park, includes two separate listed buildings (see below).

Earl de Grey public house (grade II listed) – https://historicengland.org.uk/listing/the-list/list-entry/129703

Castle Buildings (grade II listed) – https://historicengland.org.uk/listing/the-list/list-entry/1208094

Application comments:

Extension to rear of Earl de Grey and Castle Buildings – Strongly support. The proposed single-storey extension will be located to the rear of the properties, where it will be well related. The extension will be of an acceptable, lightweight and subordinate design (with its own design integrity) and will not dominate the existing buildings in scale, height, material or situation. The contemporary design will also promote honesty and 'readability' (legibility), ensuring that old and new build are clearly distinguishable.

Earl de Grey public house - To facilitate the A63 Castle Street improvement scheme (https://highwaysengland.co.uk/projects/a63-castle-street-improvement/), demolition of the Earl de Grey public house is required. The pub has been closed since 2005. The listing does not include the two-storey rear range, which has been subject to a sequence of substantial alterations and rebuilding, and the 2003 side extension, as they are not of special interest. Likewise with the interior, which has been heavily altered throughout and now contains no features of historic interest. The loss of the unlisted accretions is therefore of no heritage concern. In terms of the main listed structure, the proposal to demolish (or rather carefully dismantle) and rebuild on a new site, will on the face of it, lead to substantial harm to, but not total loss of significance of, a designated heritage asset. However, there is a clear choice here, it is a case of move it or lose it. The substantial public benefits of the A63 Castle Street improvement scheme clearly outweigh the harm in this case, and with a carefully controlled set of conditions attached to any approval granted, the substantial harm to significance can be mitigated to less than substantial by ensuring key features are restored. Furthermore, given that the pub has been vacant for over a decade (due to its now unfavourable and isolated location on the edge of the busy A63 (which will not change in the future)), securing its optimum viable use and long term future is also paramount.

There is historic precedent for the proposal here. In 1999 the grade II listed The Old Wellington Inn and the grade II listed Sinclairs Oyster Bar, Manchester were both dismantled and moved 300 metres northwards to a new location, close to Manchester Cathedral. They were both rebuilt and reoriented at 90 degrees to each other and joined together by a new stone extension to form two sides of a vibrant new square. The proposed relocation of the Earl de Grey to Waterhouse Lane is not dissimilar. The Earl de Grey will remain very close to its original historic location and in close proximity to Castle Buildings. Waterhouse Lane is also in effect a 'spiritual home' for the pub, the two having close historic social associations. The current detached nature of the pub is alien too; it was previously part of a mixed terrace. Rebuilding the Earl de Grey on the north side of Castle Buildings (with a glazed visual separation link) will re-establish a stronger built context for the pub, with a favourable focus facing towards The Bonus Arena and the provision a new public space behind both listed buildings. This will better enhance the significance of both buildings and create a complementary historic pair in the shadow of the proposed new brick faced hotel, which will further strengthen the built context.

Although I am generally supportive of the proposal in relation to the Earl de Grey, I would strongly favour the pub being rebuilt on the same building line as Castle Buildings (at the back edge of pavement) and not set back in a subordinate manner as proposed. To maintain significance, the original plan form of the building must also still be legible. Therefore, any exterior walls with new knock throughs must maintain drop downs from the ceiling and wall end nibs. New features, such as the stairwell, must not encroach into what was the public bar area. The main entrance doors must remain as double doors, not a single door as proposed. Side door must remain as a panelled

door. Proposed chimney stack is too squat and not as existing. First and second floor fenestration pattern is not as existing and must be amended accordingly.

Recommended conditions:

Before demolition, the building must be subject to a Level 4 building recording in accordance with Historic England guidance contained in 'Understanding Historic Buildings – A Guide to Good Recording Practice', 2016.

Before demolition, a methodology for carefully dismantling and reconstructing the pub must be submitted for written approval by the LPA. The methodology must also include an inventory of all building components to be reused, including brickwork. Where components are not suitable for or incapable of reuse or of insufficient quantity, details of all new materials must be submitted for written approval by the LPA.

The Earl de Grey must be rebuilt using traditional building skills and materials, eg lime mortars and renders.

The modern unsympathetic glazing in the green faience ground floor windows must not be reused. The traditional ornate decorative leaded light glazing (illustrated in a c.1950 photo on page 124 of 'Hull – Then and Now 5' by Paul Gibson, 2015) must be reinstated. Before manufacture and installation, details for the design of the window glazing (at a scale of 1:10) must be submitted for written approval by the LPA.

The new render scheme must include a large traditional, hand painted, pub related sign on the new north (old west) gable wall of the pub. Before application, details of the design (which should be inspired by the old 'Bentley's Yorkshire Brewery' sign illustrated in a 1965 photo on page 46 of 'Hull Camera 1964-1991 — A Photographer's View of Hull' by Ted Tuxworth, 1991) must be submitted for written approval by the LPA.

After demolition, the original site of the pub must be marked in the ground with a decorative piece celebrating the pub. Before manufacture and installation of the piece, details of the design must be submitted for written approval by the LPA.

Castle Buildings – No objection on conservation grounds. Good conservation practice recognises that intelligently managed change may sometimes be necessary if heritage assets are to be maintained for the long term and that, wherever possible, heritage assets should be put to an appropriate and viable use that is consistent with their conservation. For the great majority this must mean economically viable uses if they are to survive (earn their keep), and new, and even continuing, uses will often necessitate some degree of adaptation. Furthermore, keeping heritage assets in use avoids the consumption of large amounts of building materials and energy and the generation of waste from the construction of replacement buildings. Therefore, the best way of securing the upkeep of historic buildings and areas is to keep them in active use. The proposed adaptations necessary in this case appear thoughtful and sensitive, working 'with' the building as far as practically possible, rather than 'in spite of' it, thereby ensuring its essential character will not be adversely affected. External alterations are minimal, therefore no adverse impact on the setting of the Old Town conservation area or setting of other listed buildings. In relation to conditions, the following are recommended:

Before installation, details of all new internal and external doors and door architrave must be submitted for written approval by the LPA.

No floor, wall or ceiling linings to historic surfaces must be installed without the written approval of the LPA.

Kindest regards
Philip Hampel
Principal Conservation Officer
Development Delivery (City Planning)
Hull City Council
The Guildhall
Alfred Gelder Street
Hull
HU1 2AA

Tel. (01482) 612343

Email: Philip.hampel@hullcc.gov.uk

Web: http://www.hull.gov.uk

Working Days - Monday, Tuesday, Thursday and Friday



















